

# **City Council**

**Monday 19 June 2023**

## **PRESENT:**

Councillor Shayer, in the Chair.

Councillor Ms Watkin, Vice Chair.

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Laing, Loveridge, Lowry, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tofan, Tuffin, Tuohy and Wakeham.

Apologies for absence: Councillors Bingley, Finn and Sproston.

The meeting started at 2.11 pm and finished at 7.30 pm.

*Note: The full discussion can be viewed on the webcast of the City Council meeting at [www.plymouth.gov.uk](http://www.plymouth.gov.uk). At a future meeting, the Council will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.*

## **13. Minutes**

The Council agreed that the minutes of the extraordinary meetings held on 27 March 2023 and 19 May 2023, the ordinary meeting of the 27 March 2023 and the Annual General Meeting of the 19 May 2023 as a correct record, providing that the word ‘unanimously’ was removed from minute 86, of the Annual General Meeting of Council on 19 May 2023.

## **14. Declarations of Interest**

The following declarations of interest were made by councillors in accordance with the code of conduct in respect of items under consideration at the meeting -

<b>Name</b>	<b>Minute Number</b>	<b>Reason</b>	<b>Interest</b>
Cllr Evans OBE	10e	Family Member was employed by Livewell SouthWest	Private
Cllr Poyser	10e	Family Member was employed by Livewell SouthWest	Pecuniary
Cllr Mrs Bridgeman	10e	Family Member was employed by Livewell SouthWest	Private
Cllr Nicholson	10e	Family Member was employed by Livewell SouthWest	Private

## 15. Appointments to Committees, Outside Bodies etc

Council agreed to approve the proportionality and appointments to committees as set out in this report.

For (51)

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Laing, Lowry, Mrs Loveridge, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tofan, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

Against (0)

Abstain (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (1)

Councillor Shayer.

## 16. Questions by the Public

There were 10 questions submitted by members of the public.

The following question was submitted by Grace Strickland –	
<b>Question:</b> The shortage of SEN places has caused a huge gap in provision, when will the council and public be informed of the outlined planned investment to pay for the extra places required?	<b>Answer:</b> The majority of our children with EHCPs are educated in mainstream schools, forming approximately 2.5% of the mainstream school population.  Our maintained special schools are full and we have a plan for short term expansion and a strategy for medium and long term expansion of special places. These need to go alongside the approaches used by the council, schools and MATs to ensure mainstream schools are, and continue to be as inclusive as possible of children with SEND.  In the short term, the council is using government grant to expand Cann Bridge School. Funding is being used to provide modular classrooms for an additional 16 children from January 2024.

	<p>We expect and need to have the specific plans agreed by the end of 2023. We will be working with our special schools and our MATs to take this forward.</p>
The following question was submitted by Mr Batkin –	
<p><b>Question:</b> As the proposal to implement additional restricted parking in Zone GG requires the agreement of all Ward Councillors for them to be signed off I would ask the Cabinet Member if the lack of response from Cllrs Allen and Gosling is reasonable and consequently what can be done about it?</p>	<p><b>Answer:</b> Officers have been involved in dialogue with a Ward Member concerning a request for proposed changes to some unrestricted parking within this area, however no proposals have been discussed concerning additional restricted parking under a Controlled Parking Zone (CPZ). It is correct that any changes within a ward does require the consensus of all Ward Members.</p> <p>In light of your question I will ask officers engage with all Ward Members in respect to thoughts on considering any changes to restricted parking in accordance with the Councils CPZ policy.</p>
The following question was submitted by Ryan Aldred –	
<p><b>Question:</b> I know of 6 incidences of voter suppression in the May local elections thanks to new voter ID laws. Will you, as Leader of the Council, write to the Secretary of State for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities to demand this disenfranchising, undemocratic law be overturned?</p>	<p><b>Answer:</b> The Council agreed in March to undertake a review of the impact of voter ID and report to the September Audit and Governance Committee and following that review will make further representations.</p> <p>I have also raised this issue at the Local Government Association and will continue to do so over the course of the next few months, particularly as a further raft of needless changes in relation to absent voting, overseas electors and EU citizens' voting and candidacy rights are expected to come into force in advance of the May 2024 polls.</p> <p>The Voter Authority Certificate has</p>

	<p>been a disaster and I believe that there are still people staying away rather than being turned away, due to lack of ID or not applying for a VAC. I will continue to make known my opposition to these changes through all avenues available to me.</p>
The following question was submitted by George Wheeler –	
<p><b>Question:</b> The two bus shelters (in-bound) at St Budeaux Square were removed last June (2022) to allow major works to start in August 2022. That work has still not started. When will it start and if that is not imminent, will you consider providing temporary shelters until then, please?</p>	<p><b>Answer:</b> Construction of the transport improvements at St. Budeaux, including installation of the shelters, is scheduled to commence from September 2023.</p> <p>PCC does not own any of its bus shelters and neither does it have any temporary shelters. It is also not possible to source a temporary shelter in the intervening time period.</p>
The following question was submitted by Fiona Smart –	
<p><b>Question:</b> Bristol has run its 10-day Festival of Nature for 20 years. Exactly why, in view of rapidly worsening climate chaos and biodiversity decline, is Plymouth failing to organise a similar huge 10-day citywide festival to educate and motivate its citizens and voluntary groups who desperately want an opportunity to help?</p>	<p><b>Answer:</b> Thank you for your question. I agree that we should be learning from good practice nationally and I share your passion for empowering the general public to help tackle the climate and ecological emergencies.</p> <p>I'm pleased to confirm that Plymouth has already been exploring the Festival of Nature concept as part of the Green Minds partnership project we have led. This has involved running a Festival of Nature from Poole Farm involving a wide range of community organisations who have an interest in promoting nature to people in the city. We recently ran a public Green Minds conference in early June which I was pleased to open - a celebration of Nature Based Solutions and an opportunity for workshops and discussions about best practice.</p>

	<p>Over the past 5 years, we have also supported the national Love Parks Week every July, supporting local organisations to deliver events in natural spaces.</p>
The following question was submitted by Jonathan Smart –	
<p><b>Question:</b> Newly planted trees needed many litres of water each week for three years after planting otherwise they die and public money is wasted. Precisely what are the arrangements to ensure that all trees planted by PCC receive sufficient water for these critical years and especially during prolonged dry spells?</p>	<p><b>Answer:</b> Thanks for your question. I appreciate your concern for newly planted trees.</p> <p>Plymouth City Council have a schedule for watering new trees that we are responsible for planting and caring for. This schedule runs from April through to October and involves teams of staff with bowsers delivering 60 litres of water a fortnight throughout this period regardless of dry or wet spells. We do not tend to pause watering as the rainfall throughout the summer months is still not sufficient for recommended levels and as we know dry periods are increasing in longevity and frequency as a result of climate change.</p> <p>Before undertaking a tree planting programme we ensure that there are suitable funding streams available to cover this establishment period as a minimum for all maintenance and establishment costs and a contingency for potential replacements. We have utilised the Urban Tree Challenge Fund and most recently the Trees for Climate Fund programme delivered through the newly established Plymouth and South Devon Community Forest.</p> <p>We monitor the success of newly planted trees to ensure that we pick up replacements as necessary in the following planting seasons. We also work proactively with our</p>

	<p>maintenance teams to build knowledge and improve our processes. For example, this year we are utilising collecting water from Moorcroft Quarry to fill bowsers and water newly planted trees in the east of the city.</p>
The following question was submitted by John Stone–	
<p><b>Question:</b> I would like to know when the litter namely the ribbons from the city centre is to be removed from the safety fences? It should never have been left there so long acting as a focal point for protesters.</p>	<p><b>Answer:</b> Thank you for your question and thank you for your concerns regarding the state of Armada Way which we inherited from the previous Conservative Administration.</p> <p>The Leader has already taken decisive action in relation to withdrawing the previous decision by Councillor Bingley that is the subject of judicial review proceedings. Action has also been taken to tidy up the site and get this stalled project moving as businesses and local residents want us to get on with the project.</p> <p>In relation to the ribbons on the safety fencing, I can advise that some of these will be removed as part of the works that were undertaken on Friday 16 June 2023 to re-align the fencing. We have been working to open up Armada Way ahead of the main summer season and forthcoming events.</p>
The following question was submitted by Melanie Le Bars –	
<p><b>Question:</b> The Council's targets for carbon emissions reductions are below levels they needed to hit in 2023. Have Councillors undertaken Carbon Literacy Training before, applied learning and how does your pledge to reduce carbon emissions through action, as the course implored, offset carbon sequestration lost from felled mature trees?</p>	<p><b>Answer:</b> Thank you for your question. Reducing emissions across Plymouth is a top priority for me. The City Council has a Net Zero Action Plan (NZAP), which was unanimously adopted by the City Council on 27 March 2023. This sets out how positive actions are proposed to be taken to continue to drive the City Council towards becoming a net zero organisation</p>

	<p>by 2030. We are measuring how we are doing as an organisation and good progress is being made, but we acknowledge that there is much more that needs to be done.</p> <p>As you mentioned, part of that is Carbon Literacy Training. I, and a number of the Labour Cabinet have already completed Carbon Literacy training. We continue to roll this out to more councillors and officers to ensure that net zero is being prioritised by every department.</p>
--	---

The following question was submitted by Elizabeth Bailey –

**Question:** Given the catastrophic decision to fell healthy mature trees in Armada Way, making Plymouth infamous nationally and beyond, will the new Labour-led council implement a Charter for Plymouth's trees, bearing in mind the previous complete lack of regard to Plymouth's Plan for Trees?

**Answer:** The Plan for Trees was developed under Labour in 2019 and set out a strategy for the many thousands of trees in Plymouth. The principles agreed, after much consultation remain relevant:

- Promote
- Protect
- Care
- Enhance

The PfT policy also provided the catalyst for a reinvigorated tree-planting programme and our new Community Forest that has resulted in the Council planting and caring for 14,137 new trees. This policy remains largely fit for purpose and will drive towards meeting the ambition of providing trees in parts of the city most at need.

However, I can only agree that the previous administration showed disdain for the Armada Way trees and perhaps paid scant regard for our Plan for Trees. We are now reviewing a number of policies

	<p>related to green and growing to see what lessons can be learned. We are especially focussed on ensuring that all of our policies and activities take account of the Climate and Nature Emergencies.</p> <p>This does not mean that on occasion we will not have to remove some trees. There is a need to manage our woodlands, particularly with the ongoing challenges around trees that are suffering from ash die-back and those that are towards the end of their life and represent a hazard.</p>
The following question was submitted by Marie Thacker –	
<p><b>Question:</b> When will the council get on with the Armada way project considering the FOI showing monies spent from delays caused by the Judicial Review process?</p>	<p><b>Answer:</b> Thank you for your question.</p> <p>We have said that we consider the judicial review is academic and we need to get on with delivering a new scheme - taking in to account and seeking to accommodate the remaining trees.</p> <p>I will be providing a full update to all councillors under the next item on the agenda demonstrating progress since we took control of the council less than a month ago. This will demonstrate that we have taken back control of this project.</p> <p>I am however pleased to be able to announce that the I and senior Cabinet Members will be reviewing the options for the redesign for Armada Way tomorrow with a view to going out to consultation on them and then moving forward to ensure we have an implementable scheme following this.</p>

## 17. Announcements

The Lord Mayor made the following announcements to Members –

- a) Announced with sadness the passing of Alderman Ted Fry, who was a Councillor for Compton Ward from 1992 to 2018, including as Deputy Lord Mayor in the 1995/96 municipal year, had passed away on 29 May 2023. The Lord Mayor added that he was highly regarded by Councillors and Officers, he would be greatly missed and that, on behalf of the Council, he sent his heartfelt condolences to his family. A minutes silence was then held in his memory;
- b) The Plymouth and South Devon Joint Local Plan had won an award for the innovative use of digital technology in the 'My Place, My Views' consultation at the Planning Awards 2023;
- c) Platinum Parkway, also known as the Forder Valley Link Road, was named the transformation project of the year in the 2023 Chartered Institute of Highways Transportation South West Regional Awards; Sarah McVeigh accepted the award on behalf of the Strategic Transport Team;
- d) Plymouth City Council had worked with RIO and The National Trust on an innovative Plymouth Apprenticeship Scheme, which received recognition at the National Kickstart Awards for promoting diversity and inclusion; Chris Avent accepted the reward on behalf of the Plymouth National Grid Apprenticeship Scheme.

The Leader gave the following announcements:

- e) In relation to the Armada Way project:
  - i. The Leader had overturned the original decision in May 2023 and the original scheme would not be implemented;
  - ii. The administration has listened to businesses and stakeholders views and concerns and had installed several temporary benches, pushed back fencing to make access to shops better and had created a pathway through close to Oggy Oggy Pasty Shop;
  - iii. His Cabinet were working with officers on proposals for a new scheme, that would incorporate previous feedback and would consider the existing trees and biodiversity and would include more seating and larger plays for play and enjoyment;
  - iv. The Council would work with independent external engagement specialists to ensure the people of Plymouth had the opportunity to express their views;
  - v. The legal injunctions and nesting birds were making it difficult for the clean up to take place, but tree stumps would be removed within two weeks, which would allow some fencing to be pushed back further;
  - vi. The claimant had been asked to withdraw their legal action the week before, which they agreed to with conditions, which in the opinion of the Council

were above and beyond what the court would request itself and despite the Council's efforts to be reasonable and flexible, an agreement could not be reached and so the court has been asked directly to consider the application to withdraw the JR and injunction;

- f) A £25m investment had been secured for Colin Campbell Court;
- g) The Leader had signed an executive decision to approve a £19m investment in the next phase of the Derriford District Centre from the Property Regeneration Fund and Devon Contractors would be starting work imminently to provide a heart for the North of the City and the Council would derive long term income from the investment;
- h) PWC Good Growth Report had ranked Plymouth's economy at 5<sup>th</sup> highest in the UK for Good Growth with particularly strong performances in income distribution, work-life balance and transport, as well as ranking Plymouth 1<sup>st</sup> for most improved city with the highest overall change in the Good Growth score from 2022-2023;
- i) The NMP's (National Marine Park) capital projects had been funded by the Heritage Lottery and were being submitted to planning, with the projects focusing on what people had told the Council they wanted to see;
- j) The Leader was pleased to have attended his first Freeport Meeting and expressed his excitement that the Freeport would be used to incentivise more green and marine-based companies to be in Plymouth and the Leader had brought up the need to push for improvements to the National Grid across the peninsula which would be key to decarbonisation.

Councillor Jemima Laing (Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member for Children's Social Care, Culture, Events and Communications) gave the following announcements:

- k) The first four family hubs had opened in Plymouth in a new approach which aimed to give families and their children the very best start in life;
- l) The Box had reached its 500,000<sup>th</sup> visitor;
- m) The Box's Summer Programme – 'Summer of Colour and Light' had been announced and would be opened on 24 June 2023 by the President of the Royal Academy, Rebecca Salter, and would include the following three shows:
  - i. Reframing Reynolds: A Celebration - The 300th anniversary of Joshua Reynolds, who founded the Royal Academy, and the only national show celebrating the anniversary;
  - ii. Rana Begum: Dappled Light – a 21st century Royal Academician; iii. Solomon Hart: The Execution of Lady Jane Grey - The story of Solomon Hart, which would include a picture that had been lost in the archives for 100 years by the most important 19th century Jewish artist, who was also a Royal Academician;

- n) The LGA Culture, Tourism and Sport Board would be making their first visit to Plymouth on 21 June 2023, hosted at Market Hall, TR2 and The Box to hear more about Plymouth's cultural journey;
- o) It was Armed Forces week, a flag raising had taken place that morning, the Rehabilitation Triathlon would be taking place on 22 June 2023 at Plymouth Hoe, and Armed Forces Day would be celebrated on Plymouth Hoe on 24 June 2023 in association with Babcock with lots of interactive activities and a fly past by the red arrows.

Councillor Sally Haydon (Cabinet Member for Community Safety, Libraries, Cemeteries & Crematoria) provided the following update:

- p) Plymouth City Council had been granted just over £11,000 from the University of Plymouth Safer Streets from a Home Office bid to make changes to the environment to make it safer including:
  - i. Taxi marshals at North Hill Taxi Rank from 2am-6am on Saturday and Sunday mornings from 15 July 2023 to 24 September 2023;
  - ii. Improve the reformed beach on the Hoe as it had often been a hotspot for anti-social behaviour;
  - iii. Safer Community consultation equipment.

Councillor Tom Briars-Delve (Cabinet Member for Environment and Climate Change) provided the following update:

- q) Plymouth City Council had committed support to UK 100 which was a network of the most ambitious local authorities in the UK on Net Zero and so Plymouth City Council's progress against pledges would be actively monitored.

## 18. **Corporate Plan 2023-26**

Councillor Tudor Evans OBE introduced the report on the Corporate Plan 2023-26, which was seconded by Councillor Jemima Laing.

Council agreed that:

- I. The revised Corporate Plan 2023-26 was adopted as part of the Council's policy framework.

For (49)

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Laing, Lowry, Mrs Loveridge, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Reilly, Rennie, Salmon, Smith, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

Against (0)

Abstain (1)

Councillor Ricketts.

Absent/Did Not Vote (2)

Councillors Shayer and Tofan.

#### 19. **Provisional Capital and Revenue Outturn Report 2022/23**

Councillor Mark Lowry (Cabinet Member for Finance introduced the report its recommendations. This was seconded by Councillor Ian Darcy.

Following contributions from Councillors Lugger and Nicholson, Council agreed to:

1. Note the Provisional Revenue Outturn position for the year to 31 March 2023;
2. Note the Provisional Capital Programme Outturn position for that year including the Capital Financing Requirement of £86.653m.

#### 20. **Designation of Statutory Chief Officers**

Council agreed to:

1. Approve the designation of the Acting Head of Legal Services as the Monitoring Officer in accordance with section 5 of the Local Government and Housing Act 1989 from the last day of service of the current post holder. This would be until a permanent Head of Legal Services was recruited;
2. Approve the extension of the appointment of David Northey as the Interim Service Director for Finance (S151 Officer) from 30 September 2023 to 31 March 2024.

For (51)

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Laing, Lowry, Mrs Loveridge, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tofan, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

Against (0)

Abstain (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (1)

Councillor Shayer.

21. **Motions on Notice**

- (i) Armada Way

Councillor Andy Lugger introduced the motion on Armada Way, which was seconded by Councillor Bill Wakeham.

Following a contribution from Councillor Carlyle, Councillor Poyser proposed an amendment to the motion.

*The meeting was adjourned for members to consider the amendment from 3.30 pm to 3.45pm.*

The amendment was proposed by Councillor Ian Poyser and seconded by Councillor Lauren McLay and read (edits in *italics*):

This Council considers the current decision to stop the Armada Way project unacceptable to shoppers, local businesses and potential city centre investors.

Council recognises the need to re-commence this essential project expeditiously in order to revive and renew this part of the city centre (such works to include improved service media and a sustainable urban drainage system).

*However, this Council also notes that due to bird nesting season restrictions, full works cannot begin. As such, this window of time should be used to refocus the project and address historic concerns with the development.*

Ask the Leader of the Council and Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning and Infrastructure to:-

1. Bring forward a plan (whether it be implementation of the current Armada Way Project or a comparable alternative) and set a firm timeframe for implementation of the plan;
2. Consult with independent experts such as the Woodland Trust, Devon Wildlife Trust and The Plymouth Tree Partnership during the redesign phase;
3. If required, modify the sustainable urban drainage scheme to retain the existing healthy trees and plant tree species that maximise tree canopy and shading;
4. Publish on the Council website an assurance that new surface water drainage infrastructure will be installed, as a matter of urgency, to prevent raw sewage going into the sea;
5. Provide a firm timeframe in respect of point 4 above.

Following a contribution from Councillor Evans OBE, the Council agreed to accept the amendment.

For (38)

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Laing, Lowry, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Reilly, Rennie,

Ricketts, Stephens, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin and Tuohy.

Against (0)

Abstain (13)

Councillors Carlyle, Darcy, Harrison, Mrs Loveridge, Lugger, Dr Mahony, Patel, Salmon, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin.

Absent/Did Not Vote (1)

Councillor Shayer.

Following further contributions from Councillors Nicholson, Hulme, Evans OBE, Briars-Delve, Council voted and the motion was not passed.

For (13)

Councillors Carlyle, Darcy, Harrison, Mrs Loveridge, Lugger, Dr Mahony, Patel, Salmon, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham, Ms Watkin.

Against (36)

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Dingle, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Laing, Lowry, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Reilly, Rennie, Stephens, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin and Tuohy.

Abstain (2)

Councillors Partridge and Ricketts.

Absent/Did Not Vote (1)

Councillor Shayer.

*The meeting was adjourned from 4.15 pm to 4.50pm for a break.*

*Councillor Gilmour did not return to the meeting following the break.*

(ii) **Fixing Plymouth's Roads**

Councillor James Stoneman introduced the motion on Fixing Plymouth's Roads, which was seconded by Councillor Andy Lugger.

*The meeting was adjourned from 4.50 pm to 5.06 pm to consider the amendment.*

Councillor Patrick Nicholson proposed an amendment, which was seconded by Councillor Mrs Terri Beer. The amendment was to include an additional resolution that the Growth and Infrastructure Overview and Scrutiny Committee be requested to review the effectiveness of the current procedures for maintaining the City's roads and pavements and provide a report to the Cabinet and Members of the City Council.

Following contributions from Councillors Smith, Coker and Stoneman, Council agreed to amend the motion.

**For (50)**

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Laing, Lowry, Mrs Loveridge, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tofan, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

**Against (0)**

**Abstain (0)**

**Absent/Did Not Vote (2)**

Councillors Gilmour and Shayer.

Following further contributions from Councillors Evans OBE, Coker, Poyser, Mahony, Nicholson, Lowry and Stoneman, the motion was not passed.

**For (16)**

Councillors Carlyle, Darcy, Harrison, Mrs Loveridge, Lugger, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Partridge Patel, Ricketts, Salmon, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

**Against (34)**

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Dingle, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Hulme, Laing, Lowry, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Noble, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Reilly, Rennie, Stephens, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin and Tuohy.

**Abstain (0)**

**Absent/Did Not Change (2)**

Councillors Gilmour and Shayer.

*Councillor Hulme left the meeting after this item.*

(iii) **Strategic Rail Working Group**

The motion on a Strategic Rail Working Group was introduced by Councillor Ian Poyser and seconded by Councillor Lauren McLay.

Following contributions from Councillors Harrison, Evans OBE, Loveridge, Nicholson, Beer, Darcy and Coker, the motion was not passed.

**For (17)**

Councillors Mrs Beer, Carlyle, Darcy, Harrison, Mrs Loveridge, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, Nicholson, Patel, Poyser, Salmon, Smith, Stoneman, Tofan, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

**Against (29)**

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Blight, Briars-Delve, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Dingle, Evans OBE, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Noble, Penberthy, Penrose, Reilly, Rennie, Stephens, Stevens, Tippetts, Tuffin, and Tuohy.

**Abstain (3)**

Councillors Mrs Bridgeman, Partridge and Ricketts.

**Absent/Did Not Vote (3)**

Councillors Gilmour, Hulme and Shayer.

**(iv) BBC Local Radio**

Councillor Jemima Laing introduced the motion on BBC Local Radio, which was seconded by Councillor Dylan Tippetts.

Following contributions from Councillors Carlyle, Bridgeman, McLay and Allen, the motion was passed.

Council agreed to:

1. Ask the leader of Plymouth City Council Cllr Tudor Evans OBE to write to BBC director general Tim Davie to;
  - a. Express council's serious concerns about the impact of the proposals;
  - b. Request a pause in the process while the BBC carries out further consultation with listeners.

**For (48)**

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Mrs Bridgeman, Carlyle, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Evans OBE, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, Mrs Loveridge, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Nicholson, Noble, Partridge, Patel, Penberthy, Penrose, Poyser, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tippetts, Tofan, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

**Against (0)**

**Abstain (0)**

**Absent/Did Not Vote (0)**

Councillors Gilmour, Hulme, Shayer and Smith.

*Councillor Mrs Bridgeman left the meeting after this item.*

**(v) Livewell Southwest CIC Health Worker Pensions and Pay**

*Councillors Nicholson, Poyer, Smith and Tippetts had left the Chamber and were absent for the discussion and vote.*

Councillor Mary Aspinall introduced the motion on Livewell Southwest CIC Health Work Pensions and Pay, which was seconded by Councillor Sally Haydon.

Following a contribution from Councillor Mahony, Council agreed to:

- I. Ask the Cabinet Member for Health and Social Care to write to the relevant Treasury Ministers to demand reimbursement to the city for the cost of this deal.

For (41)

Councillors Allen, Aspinall, Mrs Beer, Blight, Briars-Delve, Carlyle, Coker, Dr Cree, Cresswell, Dann, Darcy, Dingle, Goslin, Harrison, Haydon, Hendy, Holloway, Laing, Lowry, Mrs Loveridge, Lugger, Dr Mahony, McLay, McNamara, Moore, Murphy, Noble, Patel, Penrose, Reilly, Rennie, Ricketts, Salmon, Stephens, Stevens, Stoneman, Tofan, Tuffin, Tuohy, Wakeham and Ms Watkin.

Against (0)

Abstain (0)

Absent/Did Not Vote (11)

Councillors Mrs Bridgeman, Evans OBE, Gilmour, Hulme, Nicholson, Partridge, Penberthy, Poyer, Shayer, Smith and Tippetts.

*Councillor Partridge left the meeting after this item.*

## 22. **Urgent Decisions**

Council agreed to note the report.

## 23. **Questions by Councillors**

	<b>From</b>	<b>To</b>	<b>Subject</b>
	Cllr Angela Penrose	Cllr Mary Aspinall	Support for unpaid carers
I	<b>Response:</b> The previous week had been national carers week and what had been highlighted is that there were a large number of carers in Plymouth and she had wanted to make sure people knew they could go onto Plymouth City Council's website to look at what support was available to them.		
	Cllr Natalie Harrison	Cllr Mark Coker	Bus Shelter Replacements Delayed
2	<b>Response:</b> The issue was occurring in other places across the city and Councillor Coker had asked for a full briefing on the issues and why replacements were taking so long and what could be done.		

	<b>Supplementary:</b> Could Councillor Harrison be updated and could temporary seating be installed.		
	<b>Response:</b> Refer to previous response.		
	Cllr John Mahony	Cllr Sue Dann	DELT Email Issues
3	<b>Response:</b> Not aware of the issue, but if any Councillors had any issues with emails they should contact DELT directly.		
	<b>Supplementary:</b> Could portfolio holder take it forward and report back?		
	<b>Response:</b> Issues could vary from Councillor to Councillor so it would be best to contact DELT direct, who could inform her as portfolio holder of any consistent issues.		
	Cllr James Stoneman	Cllr Tom Briars-Delve	Commitment to Chelson Solar Farm
4	<b>Response:</b> The project was important to Net Zero Action Plan and there were meetings due to take place imminently regarding the work.		
	<b>Supplementary:</b> Would he confirm to share information cross party as it was previously?		
	<b>Response:</b> Happy to arrange a cross party briefing for Shadow Portfolio Holders.		
	Cllr Patrick Nicholson	Cllr Tom Briars-Delve	Grass Cutting at Junctions in Plympton
5	<b>Response:</b> The administration had inherited a complicated arrangement for grass cutting from their predecessors, and the city had experienced bad weather during spring, making grass cutting difficult. In his first portfolio holder briefing, he had asked for grass cutting at junctions to be made a priority and had specifically mentioned Plympton due to issues raised to him from the area.		
	<b>Supplementary:</b> Could a schedule be shared with Councillors to help in responding to residents about grass cutting issues?		
	<b>Response:</b> There was an interactive map online. No specific dates would be given as ground conditions and weather could affect timings.		
	Cllr Bill Stevens	Cllr Mark Lowry	Increasing Interest Rates and Cost of Borrowing
6	<b>Response:</b> It was impacting borrowing costs and was continuing to increase.		
	<b>Supplementary:</b> How would this impact the Council?		
	<b>Response:</b> The Council's Capital Program was predominantly based on the Council's ability to borrow and so the program might have needed a review.		
7	Cllr Mrs Terri Beer	Cllr Tom Briars-Delve	Enforcement of Section 154 – Highways Act 1980 – Overhanging vegetation less than 8ft.

<b>Response:</b> If there were specific example, encourage Councillors to report issues to Councillor Casework for it to be raised with the relevant teams for review. If a case was not resolved to satisfaction, contact Councillor Briars-Delve with examples for further investigation.			
	Cllr Rebecca Smith	Cllr Tom Briars-Delve	Administrations opinion on residents who had resorted to cutting grass themselves across the city
<b>Response:</b> Aware and but some issues had been inherited by the previous administration. If areas in question were on a regular cutting schedules, teams would be visiting imminently to cut.			
8	<b>Supplementary:</b> Play parks were on a 7-9 week schedule. Would Cabinet Member consider creating a separate schedule for play parks, as they needed to be cut regularly and low enough for children and in certain parts of the city parks and equipment could not be used because the grass was too high?		
	<b>Response:</b> The schedule had been implemented by the previous administration and was being followed whilst practices were reviewed within the restraints of the grass cutting budget. The Cabinet Member was reviewing options for play parks and would give further information when it was available.		
	Cllr Bill Wakeham	Cllr Tom Briars-Delve	Grass cutting after wildflower planting
9	<b>Response:</b> The cutting schedule had been inherited from the previous administration. If there was an issue with a specific area, like this, recommended to send it to Councillor Casework. The Council manages a hundred of hectares of grassland across the city.		
	<b>Supplementary:</b> Example was given, would like explanation.		
	<b>Response:</b> Referred to previous answer.		
	Cllr Ian Tuffin	Cllr Tudor Evans OBE	Tidal Pool at Firestone Bay Rumours
10	<b>Response:</b> The administration wanted it to remain in use. The previous administration had not included any funding to carry out work to remove, or improve, it in 2023/24. It would be checked and kept safe over the summer season. A business case with maintenance options for the future would be prepared.		
	<b>Supplementary:</b> Would Ward Councillors be involved in next steps?		
	<b>Response:</b> Would be happy to keep Ward Councillors up to date and would make sure the tidal pool was not lost.		
11	Cllr Charlotte	Cllr Mark	Update on bus routes, specifically Route 31

	Holloway	Coker	
<b>Response:</b> The Cabinet Department had spent a day with the Department of Transport discussing issues with busses in Plymouth, finding out more information on why the Council had been unsuccessful in the first round of Better Bus Funding, and looking at improvements for the second round. He was also going through the feasibility of the 31 Route, and others to ensure parts of the city are not cut off, supported by the Cabinet Member for Finance. Hoped to be able to give a further update in the following weeks.			
12	Cllr Mrs Andrea Loveridge	Cllr Mark Coker	Bus Shelters
<b>Response:</b> There had been cross party working on the policy. Replacements would be installed where it had been agreed, and if there was a need to re-install bus shelters where they had been taken away, this would be looked into.			
<b>Supplementary:</b> No further bus shelters would be taken away?			
<b>Response:</b> All bus shelters went through a process and duplicate or low use shelters would be removed.			
13	Cllr Tess Blight	Cllr Mark Lowry	Community Diagnostics Centre
<b>Response:</b> The new diagnostics centre in the west end of the City Centre would support local people in an area of deprivation, but would also support residents from across the city. He would be meeting with representatives from the health community to see what could be brought to the north of the city to support residents there.			
<b>Supplementary:</b> Could Councillors be kept up to date and involved in plans?			
<b>Response:</b> The Cabinet Member agreed to meet with Councillors to understand issues across the city and update them on progress.			
14	Cllr Dr John Mahony	Cllr Sarah Allen	Councillor Complaints and Code of Conduct
<b>Response:</b> This would be looked into and an update would be provided.			
15	Cllr David Salmon	Cllr Mark Coker	Bus Shelters
<b>Response:</b> The Cabinet Member would conduct a review of the situation with officers and provide an update to Councillors.			
16	Cllr James Stoneman	Cllr Chris Penberthy	Unauthorised Encampments
<b>Response:</b> The Council policy was available on the Council website. He would ask for the link to be sent to all Councillors.			
<b>Supplementary:</b> Would the Cabinet Member agree that once an unauthorised encampment had visited a site, the site would be secured to try and stop it happening again?			

	<b>Response:</b> There was no budget for this, further info in the policy on targeted hardening.		
	Cllr Charlotte Carlyle	Cllr Tom Briars-Delve	Reassurance Grass wouldn't be allowed to get so high again in play parks
17	<b>Response:</b> With regards to Hartley Vale in particular, the issue had been raised directly to the Cabinet Member by Cllr Tippetts, and policy was not being correctly following in the area and due to an administrative error, the grass cutting had not been done, but it was completed within a week.		
	<b>Supplementary:</b> Had been reported to Councillor Casework twice, but happy it had been sorted. Hope it would not happen again and would be reviewed as there was no a substantial amount of wildflowers in the park.		
	<b>Response:</b> The ratio was determined by the previous administration and Community Grants could be used to plant more wildflowers.		
	Cllr Bill Wakeham	Cllr Tom Briars-Delve	SUDS Project
18	<b>Response:</b> The Cabinet Member had had a briefing on the project with the relevant officers and had asked for the Peverell Ward Councillors to be kept updated because local residents might experience disruption.		
	<b>Supplementary:</b> Could Councillor Wakeham also be kept up to date?		
	<b>Response:</b> Yes.		
	Cllr Sarah Allen	Cllr Sally Cresswell	Teacher Recruitment Crisis
19	<b>Response:</b> Known that 1/3 of teachers were leaving profession within 5 years. Science and Maths recruitment issue nationally. Significant pressure on teachers in terms of demand and pay, made worse since COVID19. Something local authority needs to be mindful of due to the consequences. Support staff were also leaving due to better pay elsewhere.		
	<b>Supplementary:</b> More detail on how this is affecting Plymouth education and early years settings?		
	<b>Response:</b> No detail or data at present but needed to be looked at as it could help mitigate impacts and support recruitment and retention of staff.		
	Cllr Ian Darcy	Cllr Tom Briars-Delve	Play Parks – Grass and Bins
20	<b>Response:</b> Grass Cutting was following the previous administrations grass cutting schedule, whilst under review by the current administration.		
	<b>Supplementary:</b> Residents took rubbish from bins to Chelson Meadow from play parks as the bins had not been emptied. Could play parks be prioritised?		
	<b>Response:</b> The Cabinet Member had asked the Director of Street Services to prioritise play parks and if something had repeatedly been reported to casework, but was not being dealt with, to raise this to him to be looked into		

further.

*Councillor Mrs Beer left the meeting at 7.08 pm.*

*Councillor Nicholson left the meeting at 7.24 pm.*

*Please note that questions, answers, supplementary questions and supplementary answers have been summarised.*